

MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS,
HELD IN WASHINGTON, D. C., FEBRUARY 11, 1921.

The fifth meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts during the fiscal year 1921 was held in its office at 1729 New York Avenue, northwest, Washington, D. C., Friday, February 11, 1921.

The following members were present:

Mr. Moore, Chairman;
Mr. Platt;
Mr. Pope;
Mr. Greenleaf;
Mr. Fraser;

also Major C. S. Ridley, Secretary
and Executive Officer.

The meeting was called to order at 9:30 a.m.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PRECEDING MEETINGS: The minutes of the preceding meeting held in Washington, D. C., January 7, 1921, and of the Committee meeting held in New York City January 10 and 11, 1921, were approved.

2. SUCCESSORS TO MR. PLATT, MR. WM. MITCHELL KENDALL AND MR. WM. SERGEANT KENDALL: Major Ridley reported having received a communication from Mr. Joseph P. Tumulty, Secretary to the President, reporting that the President had signed the commissions appointing Mr. H. Siddons Mowbray, Mr. Henry Bacon, and Mr. Louis Ayres, as members of the Commission of Fine Arts to succeed Mr. Wm. Sergeant Kendall, Mr. Platt and Mr. Wm. Mitchell Kendall, respectively.

3. ELECTION OF A VICE-CHAIRMAN: Mr. John Russell Pope was elected Vice-Chairman of the Commission to succeed Mr. Platt.

4. VERDUN MEDAL: Under date of February 2, 1921, the War Department addressed a letter of inquiry through Colonel Robert E. Wyllie to the Commission asking the purpose of the helmets on the design for the Verdun Medal as the design represented wrestlers without clothes. The matter was referred to Mr.

Fraser who reported that he had taken up the matter with Mr. Flanagan and that it will be properly adjusted. The helmets were shown to represent an army insignia. Colonel Wyllie was advised accordingly. (Exhibit A).

5. DARLINGTON MEMORIAL FOUNTAIN: Mr. Garfinkle submitted sketches made by Mr. C. P. Jennewein for the proposed Darlington fountain. The Commission thought the best design is the one representing a maiden and a ^{faun}faun, and that they would desire to see a scale model of not less than 1-1/2 inches to the foot of this design. (Exhibit B).

6. UNITED STATES CURRENCY: Mr. Moore read the following letter received under date of February 8, 1921, from Hon. J. H. Moyle, Assistant Secretary of the Treasury, in which was set forth recommendations concerning the United States currency:

"I have delayed replying to your kind letter of January 14, 1921, until certain decisions had been reached by the Secretary on matters then before him with respect to proposed revision of paper currency designs.

More than two years ago the situation with respect to raised notes became such that modification of the designs in use was indicated. The Secretary designated a committee to consider the subject of design, particularly with relation to the circumvention of counterfeiting and note-raising. Because of the condition of work at the Bureau, which has not materially decreased since the active war period, the committee deemed it ill-advised to recommend designs de novo, but considered the practical situation. Models for currency designs recently were presented by the committee to the Secretary. Meanwhile, the situation at the Bureau improving and the committee having delayed its report, the Secretary directed that three matters connected with new designs receive consideration. He instructed the committee to consider the advisability of reducing the size of the notes, which, of course, has every argument in its favor so far as I know; he further indicated the desirability of considering the artistic features of designs in cooperation with the Commission of Fine Arts; and further, he instructed the committee to consider the question of uniform bank notes, which has been, more or less, before the Department for many years. Pursuant to these supplemental instructions given by the Secretary, the committee has not yet reached conclusions. Doubtless the matter will go over until the next administration. The work of the committee should not be interrupted by the change in administration, and doubtless in due course the matter of new

designs again will be before the Secretary.

I understand the committee is authorized to consult with your Commission, and I am assured they will do so."

The Commission concurred in the recommendations made.

7. ARCHITECTURAL EXHIBITION AT PARIS: The American Institute of Architects having asked the Commission of Fine Arts to cooperate in an exhibit to take place in Paris a set of lithographic pictures on the development of Washington was mounted and sent. The Commission considered the selection very good and approved of sending them. (Exhibit C).

8. STANTON PARK LODGE: Major Ridley reported that vigorous objection has been raised by the citizens in the vicinity of Stanton Park against the location which the Commission of Fine Arts approved of the new proposed comfort station in the southeast quadrant of that Park. These objections relate to the proximity of schools to the proposed location and to the fact that the street adjacent to the location selected is used as a playground during recess by the children. In view of these objections the Commission reconsidered the matter and recommended the location of the comfort station in the northeast quadrant of Stanton Park.

9. DESIGN FOR LAMP POSTS, GEORGETOWN BRIDGE: Major Ridley reported that under date of January 28, 1921, he received the following letter together with a sketch from Major M. C. Tyler, United States Engineer Office, regarding the proposed lamp posts for the Georgetown Bridge:

"The design of concrete lamp posts for the Georgetown Bridge has not been fixed and I would appreciate the advice of the Commission. I think the posts should be severely plain, 1st, to be in keeping with the bridge and, 2nd, so that they can be cast and handled without spalling off of edges and corners.

I enclose, herewith, a sketch which is probably far from good, but gives my idea of what would be desirable from the viewpoint of the man who has to cast and handle the posts."

The Commission disapproved the lamp posts of concrete made according to the sketch submitted as they were not thought to be sufficiently vigorous. It was suggested that the sketch might serve for metal lamp posts and that this matter should be looked into. The Commission submitted its recommendations to Major Tyler. (Exhibit D).

10. WOMEN'S SUFFRAGE MEMORIAL: Mr. Moore reported that on February 5 the Commission of Fine Arts had been asked by the Senate Committee on the Library to give advice regarding the Women's Suffrage Memorial for which a program of dedication had been arranged to take place at the Capitol February 15. Mr. Moore stated that the organic act of May 17, 1910, creating the Commission of Fine Arts provided that this Act shall not apply to the Capitol building of the United States, though the Commission has given advice to committees of Congress in matters of art on requests received from them. It became unnecessary for the Commission to forward an official report to the Senate Committee on the Library since at the meeting of the Joint Congressional Committee on the Library held February 10 it was decided to permit placing the memorial in the rotunda for the presentation ceremonies, but later the memorial is to be set in a permanent location on a lower floor under the dome. The memorial consists of marble busts of Susan B. Anthony, Elizabeth Cady Stanton, and Lucretia Mott. They are the work of Mrs. Adelaide Johnson, who made them in Italy.

11. TEXTURE OF WALKS FOR THE MEADE MEMORIAL AND THE MALL: Major Ridley reported that he had inquiry made as to the cost of walks and the area in square yards from First Street through the Mall area to the Lincoln Memorial. (Exhibit E). The area would cover 220,365 square yards at from \$2.75 to \$3.00 per square yard with the plain cement walk, and from \$5.50 to \$6.00 per square yard for the scrubbed surface walks. The difference in cost of construction of the plain and scrubbed surface walks is material, though at an inspection

of these types of walks by members of the Commission at the Freer Gallery the members expressed the desirability of using scrubbed surface walks as far as possible on the Mall and particularly in front of buildings to be located on the Mall.

12. AMERICAN CEMETERIES IN FRANCE: Mr. Moore reported that the War Department had issued certificates with regard to the proposed trip authorized by the Secretary of War of members of the Commission of Fine Arts to sail to Europe for the purpose of developing American Cemeteries in France. The certificates cover travel in Great Britain, France, Belgium, occupied parts of Germany, and Italy. March 5 has been set as the date of sailing.

13. LAFAYETTE PARK: One "Preliminary sketch plan" was presented in addition to a "Study for Treatment of Lafayette Park", the latter plan being designed by Messrs. Vitale, Brinckerhoff and Geiffert. In considering the latter plan, it was believed by the Commission that the formal grass panel, facing the White House and Sixteenth Street, should relate more intimately to the White House portico and to Sixteenth Street by narrowing the width of the grass panel in such a manner that it would be the same width as the White House portico and also that of Sixteenth Street between curbs, and thus allow its adjacent sidewalks to coincide with those each side of Sixteenth Street. Further, it was felt that sidewalks should be provided for pedestrian traffic entering the north side of the park at the terminus of Sixteenth Street and then lead toward each of the two existing formal urns located on the east and west axis of the park. Again, it was felt by the Commission that a walk to the urn in the east half of the park should pass near and parallel to the existing lodge as a matter of convenient access.

The "Preliminary Sketch Plan" presented showed a 15 foot sidewalk leading from each of the four main monuments of the park toward the Jackson monument to facilitate the necessary foot traffic entering the park at the

major street intersections. In addition, for cross traffic of pedestrians from Pennsylvania Avenue to Sixteenth Street, two sidewalks each of 15 foot width were shown adjacent to the 50 foot width grass panel - so related that the grass panel coincides in width to that of Sixteenth Street and the White House portico. Similarly, the 15 foot sidewalks coincided in width with those adjacent to Sixteenth Street. As a further means of facilitating pedestrian traffic, a 12 foot sidewalk leading from the entrance of the park at Sixteenth Street to the southeast and to the southwest and finally meeting the main 15 foot walk on the axis of each of the two urns. The former walk, leading to the southeast was designed parallel to the lodge to relate more suitably to the building and thus permit of easier access.

At the north end of the grass panel, near Sixteenth Street and H Street, it was felt by the Commission that the panel should be slightly rounded to obviate the large area of sidewalk. This feature was incorporated in the plan; and the sidewalk plan, sidewalk widths and the width and axial relation of the grass panel, were approved by the Commission.

Upon the above plan was shown the preliminary arrangement of plants to be saved, plants to be cut within five years, plants to be cut immediately, and also plants to be transplanted to nursery or other parks. In this plan it was understood by the Commission that the Boxbush plants were to be removed from the proposed walks or panel area to the new sites shown and that the large evergreen magnolia trees were to be left in place until their condition required removal.

Regarding the above plant plan, the scheme for the treatment and disposal of the various trees and shrubs, was approved without change. It was recommended by the Commission that a planting plan be later submitted based on the above approved walk and plant disposal plan.

14. WEST POTOMAC PARK - EAST ELEVATION OF LINCOLN MEMORIAL PLANTING:

A perspective sketch showing the proposed planting based on the planting plan approved by the Commission October 17, 1919, and January 23, 1920, was presented. This sketch, including the latest planting done to date as a scheme for the ultimate planting, was approved by the Commission without change.

As to the planting at the rear of the Lincoln Memorial, Mr. Greenleaf said groupings of pine and groupings of magnolia grandiflora could be arranged so that either or a combination of the two will be successful, but with the idea that eventually much, or all of the pine will be taken out as the magnolia comes into its own. The use of holly has been talked of. Moderate sized pine and magnolia trees should be used.

Mr. Greenleaf suggested that pine trees be found - the North Carolina pine, the Austrian pine, the Scotch pine --that run from 18 to 30 feet in height, and then group with them on the lines already taken note of, magnolia grandiflora and holly. It was recommended that the landscape architect design a new plan for the planting area west of the Lincoln Memorial.

15. ROCK CREEK PARK CULVERT: An elevation and a coping plan for culvert was presented showing a culvert 16 feet in length with a level coping 18 inches in width by 6 inches in thickness resting on a spandrel wall of 16 inches in thickness, and with an opening 8 feet wide to carry flood water in time of maximum rainfall. The walls were designed to be constructed of native stone rubble laid to flat bedding with raked joints 1 inch deep. Further, the joints are to be raked out with a rounded wooden paddle while the mortar is still green so as to give a slightly crumbly appearance when dry. This culvert designed in accordance with the suggestions of Mr. Greenleaf was approved by the Commission without change.

16. DUPONT CIRCLE: Three plans and also one central plaza detail plan

surrounding the fountain, were presented. Two plans were shown, each featuring a single formal grass panel, one panel on the axis line of Connecticut Avenue and the other on Massachusetts Avenue. It was felt by the Commission that the remaining plan, featuring 15 foot width walks on the center lines of New Hampshire, Massachusetts and Connecticut Avenues and 10 foot width walks on the center lines of remaining streets, best solved the definite requirements of pedestrian traffic through the Circle. The six large fine trees, in line with the proposed sidewalks, were to remain in place and the walks constructed with an open area about the trunk. The remaining trees in this park were to remain, also the inner ~~grass~~ walk immediately inside the planting area. Between this last mentioned ~~grass~~ walk and the outer existing sidewalk was shown a proposed hedge treatment, formally clipped on the inside, to the existing gravel walk, but left to grow naturally without shearing to the outside, adjacent to the existing outermost sidewalk. This plan was approved by the Commission without change.

In connection with this plan, an interior plaza treatment about the fountain was shown. Adjacent to the basin of the fountain was planned a grass strip; thence outward to the limit of the circular plaza was shown a combination treatment of two 6 foot sidewalks with 3 foot squares using the brushed exposed gravel aggregate similar to the finish used in the walks about the Freer Gallery. On each side of each of the above 6 foot sidewalks was shown a Belgian block treatment of four rows of blocks. The remaining space was shown of cement sidewalks using a brush finish to obviate slipperiness, the blocks having the joints irregularly broken. This plaza plan was approved by the Commission without change.

17. GRANT CIRCLE: Of the four preliminary plans presented, each showing a series of six formal grass panels, with adjacent 8 foot walks, axing on the existing sidewalks paralleling the six most important streets and avenues

intersecting the Circle, the plan selected by the Commission showed the tree lines of all the above mentioned streets and avenues continuing into the park inside the formal grass panel, thereby intimately relating the street approaches to the park and to the proposed central motif. An inner walk ~~of 15 feet width~~, with locations for lighting and drinking fountain features and seating arrangement were shown adjacent to the 110 foot diameter circle, and within the latter, evergreen planting.

In the six sectors, between the walks, were shown planting areas to afford relief from the noise and dust of nearby street and to supply a necessary variance in the character of the planting. The large existing elm trees inside the curb of the bounding circular road were retained as a part of the plan proposed. The above plan was approved by the Commission.

Two sections, each of Varnum Street and also of New Hampshire Avenue, showing tentative grading schemes based on proposed elevations of the District Engineer's Office, were presented. The two sections, approved tentatively, showed an easement of grades between the limits of the sections.

18. MERIDIAN HILL PARK: The recent revisions by Mr. Vitale were approved. The tree trunks on the upper terrace were considered so large as to injure the architectural scale.

The proposed parterre work in the lower garden, - the use of ivy and grass - was approved. It was suggested that two lions be used to flank the approach to the Buchanan Memorial similar to the treatment at the west side of the garden.

Questions were raised by the architect in regard to changes in the architectural treatment of the south terrace to bring it more in scale with the landscape effect. The increase in the size of the lateral niches of the central motif was approved. The complete change in scale of the motif at the

head of the west ascent was in general approved subject to further studies to be submitted.

The Commission had luncheon at the Cosmos Club after which they made a trip of inspection to the Lincoln Memorial, to the Freer Gallery, and then proceeded to the Capitol to see the Women's Suffrage Memorial.

Approved:

February 14, 1921.

Dear Colonel Wyllie:

The point raised in your letter of February 2 has been considered by the sculptor of the Verdun Medal, Mr. Flanagan, in consultation with Mr. Fraser.

The object of the helmets was to indicate that war is typified, not the sport of wrestling. Mr. Fraser has suggested a method of carrying out the idea more fully.

The matter is still under consideration.

Sincerely, yours,

(signed) C. S. Ridley,

Major, Corps of Engineers,

Secretary and Executive Officer.

Colonel Robert E. Wyllie,
General Staff,
War Department.

EXHIBIT A.

February 12, 1921.

Dear Mr. Garfinkle:

The Commission of Fine Arts gave consideration to the sketches of Mr. C. P. Jennewein for the proposed Darlington Memorial Fountain at their meeting yesterday and request me to inform you that they believe by far the best design is the one representing a maiden and a ^{lawn} faun. The Commission would be pleased to see a scale model, of not less than $1\frac{1}{2}$ inches to the foot, of this design.

Sincerely, yours,

(signed) C. S. Ridley,

Major, Corps of Engineers,
Secretary and Executive Officer.

Julius Garfinkle, Esq.,
1226 F Street, N.W.,
Washington, D. C.

C O P Y

February 12, 1921.

Dear Mr. Levi:

The Commission of Fine Arts has been asked by the American Institute of Architects to send a few pictures for an exhibition to be held in Paris. A group of pictures, mounted, is being sent today to Messrs. W. S. Budworth and Son, 424 West Fifty-second Street, New York City. The Commission has been advised that it has been expected of exhibitors that they pay at the rate of \$1.50 per square foot for space. The Commission of Fine Arts has no authority to pay this expenditure which would amount to about \$18.00 for 12 square feet, out of its appropriation. However, the amount could be raised through individual contributions on the part of the members, and if it is necessary to have this done please inform me accordingly.

Very truly, yours,

(signed) C. S. Ridley,

Major, Corps of Engineers,

Secretary and Executive Officer.

Mr. Julian C. Levi, Secretary,
105 West Fortieth Street,
New York City.

EXHIBIT C.

C O P Y

February 14, 1921.

Dear Major Tyler:

The Commission of Fine Arts, at their meeting February 11, gave careful consideration to your letter of January 28, with which you submitted sketches for lamp posts for the Georgetown Bridge, and requested me to report to you as follows:

The Commission feel that the sketches submitted are not sufficiently vigorous for concrete; and are too vigorous for metal. It is suggested that the post used for street lighting in the District of Columbia is well designed, and something with the same proportions might be used on the bridge. If you shall decide to adhere to concrete, a simple design rather more stocky than the one sketched would be in accord with the architecture of the bridge. If you will send other sketches immediate attention will be given to the matter.

Sincerely, yours,

(signed) C. S. Ridley,

Major, Corps of Engineers,

Secretary and Executive Officer.

Major M. C. Tyler, Corps of Engineers,
United States Engineer Office,
War Department.

RECEIVED

January 25, 1921.

Memo. for Colonel Ridley.

Subject: Relative cost of plain and scrubbed surfaces for park walks,
based upon the present prices of materials and labor.

The plain cement walks, similar to those constructed in the parks, would cost from \$2.75 to \$3.00 per square yard. A scrubbed surface walk, similar to those at Meridian Hill or in front of the Freer Art Gallery, would cost between \$5.50 and \$6.00 per square yard. The cost of scrubbed surfaces is about twice that of the plain surfaced walks.

The walks will be constructed with a 4" concrete base composed of one part cement and two parts sand, and four parts of gravel or broken stone passing a 1-1/4" screen. The surface is composed of 1" of mortar composed of two parts of cement to three parts of specially graded aggregate. The aggregate shall be obtained by re-screening torpedo sand as passing a quarter inch screen and held on a 1/10 inch screen.

After the mortar surface has partially set it shall be scrubbed out so as to show the aggregate as a uniform texture.

(signed) F. F. Gillen,
Superintendent.

February 1, 1921.

Memorandum for Commission of Fine Arts.

SIDEWALK AREA OF MALL: Area refers to sidewalk proposed for approved Mall scheme between 1st Street and Potomac River and from South Drive to North Drive; also includes * sidewalk adjacent to south side of South Drive and sidewalk adjacent to north side of North Drive but excludes all walks to be built by the District Commissioners.

1st to 2nd Street	3,510	square yards.
2nd to 3rd "	7,430	" "
3rd to 4 $\frac{1}{2}$ "	5,710	" "
4 $\frac{1}{2}$ to 6th "	5,920	" "
6th to 7th "	4,970	" "
7th to 9th "	5,220	" "
9th to 12th "	11,100	" "
12th to 14th "	10,080	" "
14th to 15th "	4,100	" "
15th to 17th "	112,800	* does not apply here.
17th to Potomac River	49,525	since drive eliminated.
Total	220,365	square yards.

The above figures are estimated square yards of sidewalk based on the latest approved plans available.

(signed) I. W. Payne,
Landscape Architect.

EXHIBIT E.

